

Fédération Internationale des Instituts d'Études Médiévales
TEXTES ET ÉTUDES DU MOYEN ÂGE, 89

BOETHIUS
ON TOPICAL DIFFERENCES

A commentary edited by

Fiorella MAGNANO



FÉDÉRATION INTERNATIONALE DES INSTITUTS D'ÉTUDES MÉDIÉVALES

Présidents honoraires :

L.E. BOYLE (†) (Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana et Commissio Leonina, 1987-1999)

L. HOLTZ (Institut de Recherche et d'Histoire des Textes, Paris, 1999-)

Président :

J. HAMESSE (Université Catholique de Louvain, Louvain-la-Neuve)

Vice-Président :

G. DINKOVA BRUUN (Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, Toronto)

Membres du Comité :

A. BAUMGARTEN (Universitatea Babeş-Bolyai, Cluj-Napoca)

P. CAÑIZARES FERRIZ (Universidad Complutense de Madrid)

M. HOENEN (Universität Basel)

M.J. MUÑOZ JIMÉNEZ (Universidad Complutense de Madrid)

R.H. PICH (Pontificia Universidade Católica do Rio Grande do Sul, Porto Alegre)

C. VIRCILLO-FRANKLIN (Columbia University, New York)

Secrétaire :

M. PAVÓN RAMÍREZ (Centro Español de Estudios Eclesiásticos, Roma)

Éditeur responsable :

A. GÓMEZ RABAL (Institución Milá y Fontanals, CSIC, Barcelona)

Coordinateur du Diplôme Européen d'Études Médiévales :

G. SPINOSA (Università degli Studi di Cassino)

Fédération Internationale des Instituts d'Études Médiévales
TEXTES ET ÉTUDES DU MOYEN ÂGE, 89

BOETHIUS
ON TOPICAL DIFFERENCES

A commentary edited by

Fiorella MAGNANO

Barcelona - Roma
2017

ISBN: 978-2-503-57931-3

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

© 2017 Fédération Internationale des Instituts d'Études Médiévales.
Largo Giorgio Manganelli, 3
00142 Roma (Italia)

INDEX

Introduction	IX
1. <i>The aim of the De topicis differentiis</i>	X
2. <i>The title of the De topicis differentiis</i>	XIV
3. <i>The partition of the De topicis differentiis</i>	XVI
4. <i>The sources</i>	XVI
4.1 <i>Boethius's source for Themistius's tópos</i>	XVII
4.1.1 <i>Aristotle's Τοπικά</i>	XVIII
4.1.2 <i>Theophrastus</i>	XLIII
4.1.3 <i>Themistius's tópos</i>	XLV
4.1.4 <i>The tópos of Aristotle's Rhetoric</i>	LVII
4.2 <i>Boethius's sources for Cicero's locus</i>	LIX
4.2.1 <i>The loci of Cicero's De inventione</i>	LIX
4.2.2 <i>The loci of Cicero's Topica</i>	LXIII
4.2.3 <i>The Aristotelian origin of the Ciceronian locus</i>	LXVIII
5. <i>Boethius's reconciliation of the Aristotelian-Themistian tópos with the Ciceronian locus</i>	LXX
6. <i>The place of the discipline of topica in the division of logic</i>	LXXVI
7. <i>The literary success of the De topicis differentiis</i>	XCI
CHAPTER ONE	
THE FIRST BOOK OF THE <i>DE TOPICIS DIFFERENTIIS</i>	1
1. <i>The preliminary concepts for learning the discipline of topica</i>	1
1.1 <i>The ratio disserendi: ars inveniendi et ars iudicandi</i>	1
1.2 <i>The intentio operis</i>	2
1.3 <i>The propositio o enuntiatio o proloquium</i>	6
1.3.1 <i>The quality and quantity of the propositions</i>	10
1.3.2 <i>The form of the propositions</i>	14
1.3.3 <i>The propositio per se nota</i>	22
1.4 <i>The quaestio and its species</i>	33
1.4.1 <i>The thesis</i>	36
1.4.2 <i>The hypothesis</i>	47
1.4.3 <i>The material of the quaestio</i>	53
1.4.4 <i>The form of the quaestio</i>	56

1.5	<i>The conclusio</i>	57
1.6	<i>The argumentum</i>	58
1.6.1	<i>The definition of the argumentum</i>	58
1.6.2	<i>The division of the argumentum</i>	68
1.7	<i>The intentio ac utilitas topicorum</i>	75

CHAPTER TWO

THE SECOND BOOK OF THE <i>DE TOPICIS DIFFERENTIIS</i>		81
2.	<i>The division of Themistius's loci</i>	81
2.1	<i>The didactic goal of the text</i>	81
2.2	<i>The argumentatio</i>	82
2.2.1	<i>The syllogismus</i>	84
2.2.2	<i>The inductio</i>	91
2.2.3	<i>The enthymema</i>	95
2.2.4	<i>The exemplum</i>	97
2.3	<i>Themistius's locus</i>	99
2.3.1	<i>The maxima propositio</i>	102
2.3.2	<i>The maximarum differentia propositionum</i>	111
2.4	<i>The Themistii locorum divisio</i>	124
2.5	<i>The loci qui in questione sunt positi et qui a terminorum substantia ducuntur</i>	127
2.5.1	<i>The locus a definitione</i>	127
2.5.2	<i>The locus a descriptione</i>	130
2.5.3	<i>The locus a nominis interpretatione</i>	133
2.6	<i>The loci qui in quaestione sunt positi et qui terminorum substantiam consequuntur</i>	135
2.6.1	<i>The locus a toto</i>	135
2.6.2	<i>The locus a partibus</i>	141
2.6.3	<i>The locus a causis</i>	147
2.6.4	<i>The locus ab effectibus</i>	151
2.6.5	<i>The locus a corruptionibus</i>	152
2.6.6	<i>The locus ab usibus</i>	152
2.6.7	<i>The locus a communiter accidentibus</i>	153
2.7	<i>The loci qui extrinsecus assumuntur</i>	154
2.7.1	<i>The locus a rei iudicio</i>	154
2.7.2	<i>The locus a similibus</i>	155
2.7.3	<i>The locus ab eo quod magis est</i>	157
2.7.4	<i>The locus ab eo quod minus est</i>	158

2.7.5	<i>The locus a proportione</i>	160
2.7.6	<i>The locus ab oppositis</i>	161
2.7.7	<i>The locus a transumptione</i>	168
2.8	<i>The loci medii vel mixti</i>	170
2.8.1	<i>The locus a casu</i>	170
2.8.2	<i>The locus a coniugatis</i>	171
2.8.3	<i>The locus a divisione</i>	172
2.9	<i>Themistius: diligentissimus scriptor Graecus</i>	179
2.10	<i>The divisio locorum</i>	180

CHAPTER THREE

THE THIRD BOOK OF THE <i>DE TOPICIS DIFFERENTIIS</i>	187
3. <i>The division of Cicero's loci</i>	187
3.1 <i>Cicero's locus</i>	188
3.2 <i>The divisio locorum</i>	196
3.3 <i>The loci qui in ipso haerent de quo agitur</i>	197
3.3.1 <i>The locus a toto</i>	197
3.3.2 <i>The locus a partibus</i>	202
3.3.3 <i>The locus a notatione</i>	206
3.4 <i>The loci ex his rebus quae quodammodo affectae sunt ad id de quo quaeritur</i>	209
3.4.1 <i>The locus a coniugatis</i>	210
3.4.2 <i>The locus a genere</i>	211
3.4.3 <i>The locus a forma</i>	213
3.4.4 <i>The locus a similibus</i>	219
3.4.5 <i>The locus a differentia</i>	222
3.4.6 <i>The locus a contrariis</i>	226
3.4.7 <i>The locus ab adiunctis</i>	229
3.4.8 <i>The locus ab antecedentibus, a consequentibus e a repugnantibus</i>	231
3.4.9 <i>The locus ab efficientibus causis</i>	247
3.4.10 <i>The locus ab effectis</i>	250
3.4.11 <i>The locus a comparatione</i>	252
3.5 <i>The loci qui extrinsecus assumuntur</i>	258
3.5.1 <i>The locus a rei iudicio</i>	258
3.6 <i>Distinctions among some loci of Cicero's division</i>	262
3.7 <i>Themistius's and Cicero's divisions compared</i>	264

CHAPTER FOUR	
THE FOURTH BOOK OF THE <i>DE TOPICIS DIFFERENTIIS</i>	273
4. <i>The rhetoric and the loci rhetorici</i>	273
4.1 <i>The differences between dialectic and rhetoric</i>	274
4.2 <i>The ars rhetorica</i>	277
4.2.1 <i>The genus of rhetoric</i>	279
4.2.2 <i>The species of rhetoric: the genera causarum</i>	280
4.2.3 <i>The material of rhetoric: the civilis quaestio</i>	282
4.2.4 <i>The partes of rhetoric</i>	284
4.2.5 <i>The instrumentum of rhetoric and the partes instrumenti rhetoricae</i>	287
4.2.6 <i>The opus of rhetoric</i>	289
4.2.7 <i>The officium actoris</i>	289
4.2.8 <i>The finis of rhetoric</i>	290
4.2.9 <i>The partes causarum</i>	291
4.3 <i>General summary</i>	302
4.4 <i>The De inventione: the loci rhetorici</i>	304
4.5 <i>The circumstantiae</i>	306
4.5.1 <i>The loci continentia cum ipso negotio and in gestione negotii</i>	308
4.5.2 <i>The loci adiuncta negotio</i>	310
4.5.3 <i>The consecutio</i>	313
4.6 <i>The communitates inter dialecticos et rhetoricos locos</i>	314
4.7 <i>The diversitates inter dialecticos et rhetoricos locos</i>	315
4.8 <i>Conclusions about the fourth book</i>	320
<i>Conclusion</i>	323
Appendix	325
Bibliography	365
Index ancient and modern authors	393
Index contemporary authors	397